

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of a meeting of the Council held on
Thursday, 21 July 2011 at 2.00 p.m.

PRESENT: Councillor Tony Orgee – Chairman
Councillor David Bard – Vice-Chairman

Councillors: Richard Barrett, Val Barrett, John Batchelor, Trisha Bear, Brian Burling, Tom Bygott, Nigel Cathcart, Jonathan Chatfield, Pippa Corney, Simon Edwards, Alison Elcox, Sue Ellington, Jose Hales, Roger Hall, Steve Harangozo, Lynda Harford, Sally Hatton, Tumi Hawkins, Liz Heazell, Mark Hersom, James Hockney, Mark Howell, Clayton Hudson, Caroline Hunt, Pauline Jarvis, Peter Johnson, Sebastian Kindersley, Douglas de Lacey, Ray Manning, Mike Mason, Raymond Matthews, Cicely Murfitt, Charles Nightingale, Ted Ridgway Watt, Alex Riley, Deborah Roberts, Neil Scarr, Ben Shelton, Bridget Smith, Hazel Smith, Surinder Soond, Edd Stonham, Peter Topping, Robert Turner, Bunty Waters, David Whiteman-Downes, John Williams, Tim Wotherspoon and Nick Wright

Officers:	Patrick Adams	Senior Democratic Services Officer
	Alex Colyer	Executive Director, Corporate Services
	Steve Hampson	Executive Director, Operational Services
	Stephen Hills	Affordable Homes Director
	Paul Howes	Community and Customer Services Director
	Jean Hunter	Chief Executive
	Fiona McMillan	Legal & Democratic Services Manager and Monitoring Officer
	Schuyler Newstead	Housing Development & Enabling Manager
	Philly Sewell	Democratic Services Officer

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Francis Burkitt, Janet Lockwood, Mervyn Loynes, Mick Martin, David McCraith and Jim Stewart.

PRESENTATIONS

Customer Service Excellence

The Chairman presented the Customer Service Excellence standard certificate for all services to Councillor Tom Bygott, Policy and Performance Portfolio Holder. The Chairman also presented flowers to Rachael Fox, Customer Service Co-ordinator, for her hard work in achieving this.

Local Government Challenge

The Chairman re-presented Paul Knight, Senior Policy and Performance Officer, the trophy for winning the national Local Government Challenge for local authority employees.

27. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following interests in items before Council were declared:

Councillor Liz Heazell	A personal interest in item 7a, South Cambridgeshire District / Cambridge City Boundary Review, as the local member for the Trumpington Meadows site. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Sebastian Kindersley	A personal interest in item 7a, South Cambridgeshire District / Cambridge City Boundary Review, as the County Councillor for the Trumpington Meadows site.

	Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Neil Scarr	A personal interest in item 7a, South Cambridgeshire District / Cambridge City Boundary Review, as the local member for Fulbourn and a member of Fulbourn Parish Council. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor John Williams	A personal interest in item 7a, South Cambridgeshire District / Cambridge City Boundary Review, as a member of Fulbourn Parish Council. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Hazel Smith	A personal interest in item 7b, Duxford and Whittlesford Boundary Review, as the treasurer of Duxford Saturday Workshop. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Peter Topping	A personal and prejudicial interest in item 7b, Duxford and Whittlesford Boundary Review, as the local member for Whittlesford. After making a statement he took no part in the debate and left the Chamber before the vote was taken.
Councillor Mark Howell	A personal interest in item 8, Fulbourn: Windmill Estate Compulsory Purchase Order, as an employee of a Registered Social Landlord. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Robert Turner	A personal interest in item 8, Fulbourn: Windmill Estate Compulsory Purchase Order, as the former County Councillor for Fulbourn and a former member of the Windmill Estate Steering Group. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Sally Hatton	A personal interest in item 10, Proposed Installation of Photovoltaic Cells at South Cambridgeshire Hall, as her son worked in the field of climate change. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Deborah Roberts	A personal interest in item 15a, Question from Councillor James Hockney to the Leader of Council, as her son-in-law was in the armed forces. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Tumi Hawkins	A personal interest in item 16b, Notice of Motion from Councillor John Williams, as the owner of a property in Teversham. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor James Hockney	A personal interest in item 16b, Notice of Motion from Councillor John Williams, as the Council's Member Champion for the London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillors Val Barrett, Nigel Cathcart, Alison Elcox, Mike Mason, Bridget Smith, Robert Turner and Nick Wright	Individually declared personal interests in item 16c, Notice of Motion from Councillors Bridget Smith and Nick Wright, as they lived in listed buildings. Notwithstanding these interests they remained in the meeting room during this item.
Councillor Tim	A personal interest in item 16c, Notice of Motion from

Wotherspoon
Councillors John Batchelor, Sebastian Kindersley and Tony Orgee

Councillors Bridget Smith and Nick Wright, as an owner of two listed buildings. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting room during this item.
Personal interests in item 16d, Notice of Motion from Councillors Mike Mason and Jonathan Chatfield, as elected Cambridgeshire County Councillors.
Notwithstanding these interests they remained in the meeting room during this item.

28. MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 May 2011 were agreed as a correct record.

The Chairman advised Councillor Bridget Smith to discuss with the relevant Portfolio Holder a resident's dissatisfaction with an answer to a public question.

29. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Chairman announced that he had received a lovely letter from Kathy Bytheway, in response to the Chairman's letter of condolence. This letter was to be e-mailed to staff.

The Chairman announced that Councillor Mervyn Loynes' condition had improved and that he was no longer in critical care.

On the proposal of Councillor Sebastian Kindersley, seconded by Councillor Ray Manning, Council **RESOLVED** to suspend Standing Order 21.4 Recording of Business to allow any attendees to record, blog or tweet from the Chamber.

A vote was taken and by 23 votes to 18, with 9 abstentions Council agreed to have a discussion on the Northstowe and New Communities Portfolio Holder's announcement regarding the Ministry of Defence's decision to close Waterbeach Barracks. The two local members expressed concern regarding the impact on the community of both the closure of the Barracks and the Government's stated aim of selling the vacated land for new housing. It was asserted that there needed to be adequate infrastructure improvements before any new homes were completed and the dangers of building housing on a flood plain had led to the rejection of Waterbeach as a possible site for new development on two previous occasions.

Councillor James Hockney, Chairman of Scrutiny, expressed his thanks to Councillor Mason and the other members of the Planning task and finish group and to Councillor Bridget Smith and the other members of the Contact Centre task and finish group for their sterling work on these two scrutiny reviews.

30. QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC

None received.

31. PETITIONS

None received.

32. TO CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS:

32 (a) South Cambridgeshire District / Cambridge City Boundary Review (Electoral Arrangements Committee, 7 July 2011)

Councillor Robert Turner, Chairman of the Electoral Arrangements Committee, proposed the Committee's recommendation as on the agenda and Councillor Raymond Matthews, Vice-Chairman of the Electoral Arrangements Committee, seconded the proposal.

Whilst the recommendation was welcomed, concerns were expressed that the Council would be asked to reconsider similar boundary reviews in the future. Councillor Ray Manning explained that the Council had entered into the process with the aspiration of making minor changes to the authority's boundary with the City Council. Unfortunately the changes that came forward were far larger and were unacceptable to the District's residents. He further explained that the plans had been under discussion for three years, but he recognised that the Boundary Commission had not given enough time for the Council to consult with its parish councils over the proposed decision.

Council unanimously **RESOLVED** not to pursue the boundary review between South Cambridgeshire District Council and Cambridge City Council.

32 (b) DUXFORD and WHITTLESFORD: Boundary Review (Electoral Arrangements Committee, 7 July 2011)

Councillor Robert Turner, Chairman of the Electoral Arrangements Committee, proposed the recommendation made by the Committee that the Council proceed with making an application to the Local Government Boundary Commission for a Related Alterations Order to come into force in May 2012. However, Councillor Turner made it clear that he personally preferred Option C, which was not to make an application in 2011 but to review after the May 2012 elections. Councillor Raymond Matthews seconded the Committee's recommendation.

Councillor Peter Topping, local member for Whittlesford, reported that his parishioners had expressed irritation with the fact that a boundary change would mean that they would have to vote two years in a row. Councillor Topping left the Chamber before the Council's vote was taken.

Concern was expressed regarding the opposition of many members to the Committee's recommendation. It was stated that any decision not to alter the boundary would perpetuate the anomaly whereby the boundary for Duxford and Whittlesford parish councils differed from that used for the District Councillors. It was also suggested that the A505 was a natural boundary, which necessitated the change. It was further suggested that opposition to the proposal was political, as the party that currently held both seats did not want an election next year. In response to these concerns it was stated that Council was the decision making body on this issue and could take an alternative decision, there was no party whip on this matter and the recommendation was opposed as bi-elections cost £4,000 and so it made financial sense to wait a year.

A vote was taken and, with 24 votes in favour, 25 against and 1 abstention, Council **REJECTED** the Electoral Arrangements Committee recommendation to proceed with

- (a) making an application to the Local Government Boundary Commission for a Related Alterations Order to come into force in May 2012; and
- (b) to prepare for a further election in Duxford in May 2012 on the assumption that a Related Alterations Order is granted.

33. FULBOURN: WINDMILL ESTATE COMPULSORY PURCHASE ORDER

Councillor Mark Howell presented this report which recommended making Compulsory Purchase Orders in respect of 26 Grandridge Close, Fulbourn and 12 Farmers Row, Fulbourn to allow the properties to be demolished and the sites redeveloped for new housing. He explained that without the Compulsory Purchase Orders the scheme could become unviable and there could be serious financial consequences for the Council.

Councillor Howell proposed the recommendation in the agenda and Councillor Liz Heazell seconded the recommendation.

Councillor John Williams, member for Fulbourn, stated that Fulbourn Parish Council and the vast majority of Fulbourn residents supported the use of Compulsory Purchase Orders, which were necessary to ensure the completion of the renovation of Windmill Estate, as the two properties were part of a block of houses and so could not be left in isolation. Councillor Neil Scarr, member for Fulbourn, stated that Council had originally promised that Compulsory Purchase Orders would not be used. He recognised the difficult decision that Council had to make, as more affordable housing was needed, and he urged all Councillors to follow their conscience.

Councillor Howell stated that the offer of compensation made by Accent Nene was a generous one and that if the Council agreed the use of Compulsory Purchase Orders the owner / occupiers could still accept Accent Nene's offer. It was stated that the rights of the individuals to remain unhindered in their own properties should be respected.

Councillor Ray Manning, Chairman of the Windmill Estate Steering Group, feared that the Windmill Development would not be completed and the Council would be liable to compensate Accent Nene if the Council did not agree the use of Compulsory Purchase Orders.

A vote was taken and, with 39 votes in favour, 6 against and 5 abstentions Council **RESOLVED** to:

- (a) approve the making of the Compulsory Purchase Orders in respect of the site at 26 Grandridge Close, Fulbourn;
- and, in respect of the site at 12 Farmers Row, Fulbourn pursuant to the provisions of Section 17 of the Housing Act 1985 and the Acquisition of Land Act 1981, to
- (b) enable the provision of housing accommodation by the Council's partner housing association Accent Nene in respect of the Windmill Estate redevelopment project.

34. FOOD SAFETY SERVICE PLAN 2011/12

Councillor Sue Ellington proposed that Council agree the Food Safety Service Plan 2011/12 and Councillor Ray Manning seconded this recommendation.

Council unanimously **AGREED** the Food Safety Service Plan 2011/12.

35. PROPOSED INSTALLATION OF PHOTOVOLTAIC PANELS AT SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE HALL

Councillor Peter Topping, Planning and Climate Change Portfolio Holder, presented this item, which sought the approval of Council to use capital reserves to invest in the installation of photovoltaic panels at South Cambridgeshire Hall.

It was recognised that the current level of Feed In Tariff was expected to be reduced in April 2012, but tariffs will be fixed for 25 years for projects completed by March 2012. Councillor de Lacey proposed that the recommendation be amended so that the project was contingent on meeting this deadline and Councillor Topping accepted this amendment.

It was recognised that the £190,000 cost was a maximum figure and it was hoped that the Council would be able to install the photovoltaic panels at a reduced cost. It was further recognised that this project would achieve a return of over 5%, reduce the running costs of the Council and reduce the Council's CO₂ emissions. It was hoped, that if agreed, the Council would publicise this, as it would show community leadership.

A vote was taken and with 42 votes in favour, 1 against and 5 abstentions, Council **RESOLVED**

- (a) to approve an increase in the capital programme of up to £190,000 to fund the installation of an array of photovoltaic panels at South Cambridgeshire Hall provided installation takes place before the end of March 2012; and
- (b) that authority be delegated to the Sustainability, Planning and Climate Change Portfolio Holder, in consultation with the Climate Change Working Group, to approve the necessary scheme design and contract award.

36. APPOINTMENTS TO THE INDEPENDENT REMUNERATION PANEL 2011-2014

The Chairman proposed and Councillor Ray Manning seconded the recommendation as laid out in the agenda and Council unanimously **RESOLVED** to appoint the following persons to form an independent remuneration panel, with immediate effect:

- (a) Graham Jagger for a 2-year term of office, with an expiry date of 31 July 2013;
- (b) Simon Harris for a 3-year term of office, with an expiry date of 31 July 2014; and
- (c) Kevin McIntyre for a 4-year term of office, with an expiry date of 31 July 2015;

Council further **AGREED** the level of expenses paid to individual members of the panel, commensurate with the work carried out by them during their terms of office, the figure to be no more than £200 each per financial year; the final amount payable to be agreed by the Executive Director, Corporate Services in consultation with the Leader of Council.

37. APPOINTMENT TO STANDARDS COMMITTEE OF INDEPENDENT AND PARISH COUNCIL MEMBERS 2011-2015

The Chairman proposed and Councillor Cicely Murfitt seconded the recommendation as laid out in the agenda and Council unanimously **RESOLVED** to

- (a) co-opt Mrs Kathleen English and Mr James Williams to the Standards Committee for a further term of up to four years as independent members; and
- (b) co-opt Councillors Rick Bristow of Cottenham Parish Council and Simon Martin of Teversham Parish Council to the Standards Committee for a term of up to four years as parish council members.

38. QUESTIONS ON JOINT MEETINGS

No discussion took place as no minutes from joint meetings had been published since the last meeting of Council.

39. UPDATES FROM MEMBERS APPOINTED TO OUTSIDE BODIES

Council **NOTED** that the Local Government Arts Forum: Cambridgeshire and Peterborough, to which the authority had made appointments to since 2002, had ceased to meet.

39 (a) Conservators of the River Cam: End of Term Report from Cllr Hazel Smith (SCDC Representative 2004-2011)

Council **NOTED** the report from Councillor Hazel Smith as the Council's former representative on the Conservators of the River Cam.

40. QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS

40 (a) From Councillor James Hockney to the Leader of Council

Councillor James Hockney asked: "The Local Government Association has cited a

number of examples of where Councils are going the extra mile in helping our armed forces personnel once they leave the service. Could the Leader please let us know what we are doing as an authority to support our brave servicemen and servicewomen once they leave the armed forces?"

The Leader referred the question to Councillor Mark Howell, Portfolio Holder for Housing, who replied that the Council were working with 32 partner agencies to support those who left the armed forces and by working within the guidelines of the LGA he hoped the Council would be able to introduce a scheme by which former servicemen and servicewomen could be fast-tracked into affordable housing.

40 (b) From Councillor Ben Shelton to the Leader of Council

Councillor Ben Shelton asked: "I have read with concern in the local newspaper that the Greater Cambridgeshire Partnership, who we a member of, is planning to close with the remaining funds, which includes taxpayers' money, being transferred into a private company. Can I ask what our position and view on this is?"

The Leader referred the question to Councillor James Hockney, as the Council's representative on the Greater Cambridgeshire Partnership. Councillor Hockney stated that he had opposed the transfer of funds to the private company, as had the majority of Councillors on the Partnership. When asked to specify this majority, he replied that all bar one of the Councillors were opposed.

40 (c) From Councillor Bridget Smith to the Leader of Council

Councillor Bridget Smith asked: "can the Portfolio Holder please explain why he thinks that over 60 of our officers felt it was necessary to conduct their own survey into the outcomes of the Job Evaluation Process and what he thinks they hope to gain by circulating their findings to al elected members."

The Leader referred the question to Councillor Simon Edwards, Finance and Staffing Portfolio Holder, who stated that he believed the results of the Job Evaluation Process had been a shock for many staff as they had not been as fully involved in the process as they might have been, as they might not have believed that the results would affect them as much. When queried further on staff motivation, Councillor Edwards pledged that he and the rest of Cabinet would continue to work with their officers and support them.

40 (d) From Councillor Mike Mason to the Leader of Council

Councillor Mike Mason asked: "In the knowledge that the Government's Localism Bill will remove top down targets for house building, will the Leader give elected members a categoric assurance that they will make the final decisions on the location, type and scale of new development in the District, through the revision of the Local Development Framework and subsequently by the Development Control process?"

Councillor Tim Wotherspoon was nominated to answer the question as Northstowe and New Communities Portfolio Holder, and explained that the Local Development Framework would be reviewed and adopted in line with national planning policy guidance. Unless there were unforeseen changes to the Localism Bill, Regional Plans would be revoked upon enactment. From that time the highest order of plan would be the District Council's Local Development Framework, which would then form the policy basis for determining planning applications. In response to supplementary clarifications, Councillor Wotherspoon explained that the Planning Committee had to determine the "soundness" of the Local Development Framework.

40 (e) From Councillor Tumi Hawkins to the Leader of Council

Councillor Tumi Hawkins asked: "Now that the facilities for creating personal sites and blogs on the Council website has been made available, when will the Cabinet Members be setting up their to set us an example and show that we are not just a listening Council, but a doing Council that is keen to communicate in modern ways?"

Councillor Ray Manning, Leader of Council, stated that he supported the Cabinet members who had created personal websites and blogs, but that it was a free choice and he would not coerce anybody to follow their example.

41. NOTICES OF MOTION

41 (a) Standing in the name of Councillor Neil Scarr

Councillor Neil Scarr, seconded by Councillor Ray Manning, moved that "South Cambridgeshire District Council notes that whilst this Council and Cambridgeshire County Council are facing reductions to their financial settlements in 2011/12, the UK's contribution to the European Union is set to rise by 60% over two years.

"Council notes that despite the opposition of some MPs (and Labour and Conservative MEPs) it seems likely that the government will agree to a further 2.9% increase in the European Union's budget overall.

"Council believes that the European Union should be treated the same as these other tiers of government, and should share responsibility in these austere times for reductions in public spending. Sharing the burden in this way should result in less severe cuts for local authorities, and allow us better to protect front line services of great importance to those we represent.

"Council therefore urges the two MPs representing South Cambridgeshire not to support any increase in UK contributions to the European Union in the present financial climate."

The Legal and Democratic Service Manager and Monitoring Officer explained that the motion was valid as it was relevant to the District.

Concerns were expressed regarding the accuracy of the motion, as it was stated that the UK's contribution was dependent on the exchange rate and the amount in Euros had been fixed since 2007 and could not be altered until 2014. In contrast, it was stated that the European Union was not spending responsibly and any reduction in its expenditure would be welcomed. It was suggested that the motion should have urged the Council to write to the region's MEPs not MPs.

A vote was taken and with 17 votes in favour, 18 against and 9 abstentions the motion was declared **LOST**.

41 (b) Standing in the name of Councillor John Williams

Councillor John Williams, seconded by Councillor Tumi Hawkins, moved that "This council supports Marshalls in its desire to attract private and commercial flights associated with the 2012 Olympics to Cambridge Airport. However, we are also mindful of the need to protect its neighbouring communities from adverse environmental impacts arising from this and therefore seek assurance from the airport operator that in connection with the Olympic traffic no take off or landing or the ground running of aircraft engines will take place between the hours of 23:00 and 07:00 hours BST except in emergencies, in order to protect residents from noise nuisance during normal sleeping hours. Should an assurance not be forthcoming, then this council asks officers to work

with Cambridge City Council to take action under the Environmental Health Acts to do all they can to restrain such night time operations for the benefit of its residents.”

Councillor Caroline Hunt, the Council’s representative on the Marshall Airport Cambridge Consultative Committee, suggested that the matters raised should have been brought to the attention of that Committee and not brought to Council.

Concerns were expressed regarding the importance of both Marshalls and the Olympics to the District and the detrimental effect the motion could have on both. It was also stated that responsibility for enforcing airport regulations rested with the Civil Aviation Authority and not with local councils.

A vote was taken and with 12 votes in favour, 27 against and 3 abstentions the motion was declared **LOST**.

41 (c) Standing in the names of Councillors Bridget Smith and Nick Wright

Councillor Bridget Smith, seconded by Councillor Nick Wright, moved that “In the light of the work currently being undertaken on the Cambridgeshire Renewables Infrastructure Plan, that this council review its policies regarding the installation of photovoltaic cells and solar thermal panels in listed buildings **taking into consideration English Heritage guidelines and best conservation practice**. This to be done with a view to facilitating the uptake of these technologies in order to support the regional green economy and reduce the carbon emissions of our villages.”

Councillor Bridget Smith accepted an addition to the motion as shown above in bold.

Council noted the importance of preserving the street scene on listed buildings in conservation areas and the vast knowledge and enthusiasm of listed building owners in the District.

A vote was taken and, with 31 votes in favour, 3 against and 2 abstentions, Council **RESOLVED** that “In the light of the work currently being undertaken on the Cambridgeshire Renewables Infrastructure Plan, that this council review its policies regarding the installation of photovoltaic cells and solar thermal panels in listed buildings taking into consideration English Heritage guidelines and best conservation practice. This to be done with a view to facilitating the uptake of these technologies in order to support the regional green economy and reduce the carbon emissions of our villages.”

41 (d) Standing in the names of Councillors Mike Mason and Jonathan Chatfield

Councillor Mike Mason, seconded by Edd Stonham, moved that “Council notes with grave concern the proposed de-registration and cancellation of the existing Orchard Park B bus service by Stagecoach in the Fens Ltd, as published in Notices and Proceedings by the Eastern Area Traffic Commissioner and dated 29th June 2011. Bearing in mind that the former Citi 4 service on this route had already received over nine hundred thousand pounds in public subsidies and that a replacement subsidised guideway service will not make use of bus shelters now being provided, Council hereby requests the Chief Executive to write, as a matter of urgency, to the Traffic Commissioner and to Cambridgeshire County Council, expressing this Council’s concern over an apparent misuse of taxpayers’ money.”

Councillor Ray Manning proposed, and Councillor Nick Wright seconded, that Council move to a vote on this matter. Council agreed to move to a vote and so a vote was taken and with 13 votes in favour, 14 against and 4 abstentions the motion was declared **LOST**.

42. CHAIRMAN'S ENGAGEMENTS

The list of Chairman's engagements since the last Council meeting were noted with the following amendments:

- On 15 July 2011 the Chairman opened "Wisbey's Yard affordable housing scheme, Haslingfield".
- The engagements on 15 and 17 July were attended by the Vice-Chairman not the Chairman.

The Meeting ended at 6.00 p.m.
